



**ENGAGING  
THE NOW**

**Arguments, Research, and New  
Environments for the Arts**

**Symposium Proceedings**

**The 2009 Symposium of the Western States Arts Federation**

**October 15 - 16, 2009**

**The Aspen Institute, Aspen, Colorado**

**Sponsored by the Western States Arts Federation**

**WESTAF**

**Printed from e-media with permission by:**

Curran Associates, Inc.  
57 Morehouse Lane  
Red Hook, NY 12571



**Some format issues inherent in the e-media version may also appear in this print version.**

ISBN: 978-1-83: 5; -58: -7

Copyright© (422; ) by the Western States Arts Federation (WESTAF)  
All rights reserved.

Printed by Curran Associates, Inc. (4233)

For permission requests, please contact the Western States Arts Federation (WESTAF)  
at the address below.

Western States Arts Federation (WESTAF)  
1743 Wazee Street, Suite 300  
Denver, CO 80202

Phone: toll free: (888)-562-7232  
(303)-629-1166  
Fax: (303)-629-9717

[staff@westaf.org](mailto:staff@westaf.org)

**Additional copies of this publication are available from:**

Curran Associates, Inc.  
57 Morehouse Lane  
Red Hook, NY 12571 USA  
Phone: 845-758-0400  
Fax: 845-758-2634  
Email: [curran@proceedings.com](mailto:curran@proceedings.com)  
Web: [www.proceedings.com](http://www.proceedings.com)

## Table of Contents

<b>ABOUT THE SYMPOSIUM SPONSOR</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>SYMPOSIUM PARTICIPANTS</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSIONS</b>	
<b>KEYNOTE PRESENTATION</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Douglas McLennan</b>	
<b>FILM INCENTIVES IN THE STATES</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Presenters: Ned Rightor, Jon Hendry</b>	
Ned Rightor presents the work he and co-author Susan Christopherson completed regarding the efficacy of film incentives. In addition to providing a critique of current incentive programs, Rightor suggests ways film incentives can be made more effective. Jon Hendry presents a view of the value of film incentives from a state perspective. He discusses how incentives function in New Mexico and provides an overview of the short- and long-term benefits of such incentives to a state.	
<b>ARTS EDUCATION: ADVOCACY AND RESEARCH</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>Presenters: Lynn Waldorf, Laurie Schell</b>	
Arts education advocates have long cited research that demonstrates the contribution of arts education to the learning process. Unfortunately, some of the traditionally cited findings have emerged from research that does not stand up to rigorous scrutiny. Lynn Waldorf and Laurie Schell present an overview of research commonly used in arts education advocacy work and note its strengths and weaknesses. They also discuss current trends in arts education advocacy research.	
<b>BEYOND ECONOMIC IMPACT STUDIES: ECONOMIC ARGUMENTS FOR THE ARTS</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>Presenter: Larry Meeker</b>	
<b>Respondents: André Pettigrew, Ann Markusen</b>	
Larry Meeker presents analysis and critique on measuring economic activity in the arts, including a review of economic development efforts currently underway that focus on creativity as their central element. André Pettigrew and Ann Markusen respond.	
<b>MESSAGING PART I: CONSTRUCTING THE ARGUMENT</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>Presenter: Danielle Endres</b>	
<b>Respondent: Douglas McLennan</b>	
Advocates for the arts—especially advocates for public funding of the arts—have employed a wide array of arguments to promote their beliefs. Danielle Endres presents the latest research in the area of argumentation theory and practice and proposes a framework for the design of an effective argument for the arts. She also demonstrates the use of argumentation theory in her work with American Indian tribes who advocate to policy makers and others for the preservation and protection of sacred lands. Douglas McLennan responds.	

<b>MESSAGING PART II: ARTS AND CULTURE REDEFINED</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>Presenters: Jennifer Hahn, Jennifer Mello, Joaquín Herranz, Jr.</b>	
<b>Respondent: Ann Markusen</b>	
For many state arts agencies and their constituents, providing compelling reasons for states to fund the arts is increasingly difficult, and the arguments are often ineffective. Building on the previous symposium session on the effective design of an argument, Jennifer Hahn, Jennifer Mello, and Joaquín Herranz, Jr. further explore strategies for making the case for public art funding to policy makers. Ann Markusen responds.	
<b>WHERE ARE THE YOUNG PEOPLE (IF THEY'RE NOT AT THE SYMPHONY)?: SHIFTING GEARS IN A NEW ERA OF AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION AND ENGAGEMENT</b>	<b>51</b>
<b>Presenters: Steven Tepper, Jennifer Novak-Leonard, and Kwende Kefentse</b>	
Audience participation and engagement continue to be critical topics in the arts. Although some studies indicate that fewer young people are attending traditional arts events, their attendance at rock and indie music concerts continues to be strong. In addition, young people in great numbers purchase the latest iPod and other technology, attend guerrilla knitting circles and other DIY activities, and spend a great deal of time on Facebook. Some blame weakened arts and music education in K-12 school years for the lack of young faces in the audiences of traditional arts and classical music events. Others contend the movement away from traditional art forms is a natural evolution of shifting interests. In this session, Kwende Kefentse, Steven Tepper, and Jennifer Novak-Leonard discuss these and other issues related to the participation of young people in the arts and creative activities.	
<b>CULTURAL POLICY IN THE UNITED STATES AND EUROPE</b>	<b>61</b>
<b>Presenters: Ilona Kish, John Holden</b>	
As the cultural policy establishment of the United States is consumed by events within the country's borders, our colleagues in Europe and beyond face different cultural policy challenges. Ilona Kish and John Holden present an overview of current thinking and cultural policy trends in Europe and link those trends to current cultural concerns in the United States.	
<b>RETHINKING THE STRUCTURE AND SCOPE OF STATE ARTS AGENCIES</b>	<b>71</b>
<b>Presenter: Julia Lowell</b>	
State arts agencies have enjoyed over 40 years of success. Due to their creative work, the arts have been made available to even the most remote areas of the country. Today, some argue that in order to assist in the next stage of arts development, the agencies need to be restructured and revitalized. Led by Julia Lowell, this session features a discussion about how agencies might transform and redevelop over the next 10 years in order to position themselves for the future.	
<b>A P P E N D I X</b>	
<b>BACKGROUND READINGS</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>SYMPOSIUM AGENDA</b>	<b>81</b>
<b>PARTICIPANTS' BIOGRAPHIES</b>	<b>83</b>
<b>SYMPOSIUM OBSERVERS</b>	<b>89</b>